

Beyond Title VI: Intentional Outreach

by

Mary Dolores Young
Via Mobility Services
for Boulder County Mobility for All

December 22, 2016

Executive Summary

A 2016 Mobility for All Needs Assessment and Action Plan identified a need for more transportation education and information in Spanish. More education and information, however, does not necessarily increase *access*.

The term *access* is key. *Access*, as seminally defined by Penchansky and Thomas (1981) is the degree of “fit” between customers and a system and has five distinct dimensions: *accessibility*, *affordability*, *accommodation*, *availability* and *acceptability*. *Accessibility* relates to geography, where is it and how easy or difficult is it to get there. *Affordability* relates to customers' income such as pricing structure of services and payment options. *Accommodation* is the manner in which a system is organized, such as days and hours of operation, existence of walk-in facilities, languages spoken. *Availability* is how well the volume and type of services correlates to the volume and type of need. *Acceptability* encompasses the attitudes of the system with respect to the client and the attitudes of the client with respect to the system as they relate to, for example, age, gender, social class and ethnicity. Barriers to *access* will likely not fall into neat categories of the five dimensions. The important idea is to approach outreach through a structured approach and an awareness of the five dimensions.

Outreach to the Latino community in Boulder County to provide *access* should:

1. identify barriers to use
2. identify solutions and actions
3. create relevant marketing material and communication channels
4. leverage community assets

Some solutions to addressing barriers will be simple and inexpensive others may require significant investments. Identifying criteria for where public funding should be invested to overcome barriers as well as logical sources of funding must be established.

This outreach strategy recognizes and acknowledges that the concept of *access* is complex and that its characteristic multi-dimensional nature requires a more comprehensive approach to conducting outreach to the Latino community. By thoughtfully and collaboratively addressing these barriers, the county can better facilitate opportunities for multi-cultural communities to *access* existing transportation options.

Introduction

A 2016 Mobility for All Needs Assessment and Action Plan identified a need for more transportation education and information in Spanish. Such was the genesis of this project: to develop a strategy for the foundation of future outreach efforts. More education and information, however, does not necessarily increase *access*¹.

The term *access* is key. *Access*, as seminally defined by Penchansky and Thomas (1981) is the degree of “fit” between customers and a system and has five distinct dimensions: *accessibility*, *affordability*, *accommodation*, *availability* and *acceptability*. *Accessibility* relates to geography, where is it and how easy or difficult is it to get there. *Affordability* relates to customers' income such as pricing structure of services and payment options. *Accommodation* is the manner in which a system is organized, such as days and hours of operation, existence of walk-in facilities, languages spoken. *Availability* is how well the volume and type of services correlates to the volume and type of need. *Acceptability* encompasses the attitudes of the system with respect to the client and the attitudes of the client with respect to the system as they relate to, for example, age, gender, social class and ethnicity and is where culture becomes relevant.

While increasing awareness and providing education and information in Spanish are important actions to take, it is more important to first identify and break down barriers. By recognizing *access* as multi-dimensional, a more nuanced and intentional approach to outreach emerges.

Thus, before undertaking efforts to raise awareness or education about transportation options, outreach must first identify barriers to use and potential solutions. “The important issue is *access*: the ease with which people can gain it, the barriers that keep them from it, and the opportunities provided for them to take advantage of it.”²

Intentional Outreach

Intentional outreach begins by recognizing the Latino community as an asset who makes many contributions to our community. They are critical to our business vitality. As employees,

- 1 Throughout this report, the term *access* in italics refers to its multi-dimensionality. Each component of *access* also appears in italics to reference it as one of its (*access*) components. If one of the six terms is not in italics, it is not referencing a relationship to *access* as a multi-dimensional term.
- 2 Community Toolbox website. Italicized *access* is mine.

they pay taxes and as residents they spend money. The community is also a font of information and can be tapped as a rich source of suggestions. Outreach should extend beyond the identification of barriers to include the search for ideas and solutions.

While Boulder County is relatively rich in transportation options, some, shared options in particular, were designed to appeal to a particular demographic. As a consequence, options such as carshare, bikeshare, vanpool, some aspects of transit and specialized transportation do not respond to or fit the needs of those outside of the demographic for which they were designed. In these cases, the outreach should focus on the introduction of the options to the community, not to make them use the options as they exist, but to find out how *they* would have designed them for *their* community. This approach could simultaneously identify barriers and solutions. Adjustments to services based on this outreach would likely also benefit everyone.

Barriers to *access* will likely not fall into neat categories of the five dimensions. Overlap between and among the dimensions will likely exist and a solution to one dimension may also provide the solution to another. The important idea is to approach outreach through a structured approach and an awareness of the five dimensions.

The community's ideas and identified barriers will ultimately require action. Some solutions may be easy and inexpensive others may take time and money. Nevertheless, only after addressing barriers holistically, can *access* improve.

With that, transportation outreach to the Latino community in Boulder County to provide *access* should:

1. identify barriers to use
2. identify solutions and actions
3. create relevant marketing material and communication channels
4. leverage community assets

Access for all can be achieved only by working directly with the community as collaborators to identify barriers, solutions and action, establishing communication methods that work and capitalizing on cultural brokers³ that already exist.

³ A cultural broker is a person who bridges, links or mediates between individuals or groups of two cultures. The term is further defined in the Leverage community assets section.

1. Identify barriers to use

Outreach for any given mode should begin with identifying barriers to use. It is likely that the most significant barriers will fall under the *access* dimensions of *accessibility* and *affordability*. Barriers will likely also vary by mode and municipality. Outreach presentations and materials should be modular so that presentations and outreach can easily be adapted to location and audience. A generic presentation on all options, while easy and convenient for the presenter, can easily render itself irrelevant if, for example, you are in Lafayette and presenting on carshare. Below, the dimensions are presented in order of suggested priority. Appendix E contains a tabular identification of known barriers by various modes as well as some suggested solutions.

Barriers to *accessibility* consider the relationship between the location of supply and the location of users as well as the effort and time required of the user to use. It is one thing to have access to an option that takes an hour of time to arrive at a destination, it is entirely another to expend lots of energy and three hours doing so. The latter renders the service inaccessible.

Affordability can be a huge barrier. In addition to the actual cost, barriers to affordability can include pricing structure and payment options. For example, a pricing structure that only considers individual usage can make usage unaffordable to a family. There is also a dynamic relationship among affordability, safety and health within the Latino community (this applies to any vulnerable population) Tradeoffs and choices are made, for example, between transit and food, transit and operating unsafe cars, transit and the myriad of unhealthy youthful choices.

The service should be available and deliverable (*availability*.) *Availability* relates to days and times the service is available. Many low-income Latinos work retail jobs on Sundays, transit is less available on these days, thus for them there is no *availability* of transit. As much as possible the volume and type of service should correlate to the volume and type of need. In calling up to request service and no appointments are available, for the person calling in that service is not *available*.

Barriers of *accommodation* include language, required types of identification, appointment system and hours of operation. Accommodations are made when issues arising through limitations related to items such as the aforementioned are addressed. Low-income Latinos (or other immigrants) are more likely to be unable to meet the baseline expectations of

an organization's systems. Recognition of non-mainstream situations can inform outreach questions that help determine proper accommodations.

Barriers of *acceptability* can be the most challenging to overcome. Because of their manifestation in attributes of age, gender, social class and/or ethnicity, they may require significant commitment on behalf of organizations. *Acceptability* is often addressed by hiring a bilingual/bicultural outreach employee. This is a simplistic solution. Overcoming *acceptability* barriers must go beyond a single employee. Addressing *acceptability* necessitates ongoing processes with no end point that implicate organizational cultures as well as systems.

Addressing *acceptability* often brings up the idea of cultural competency. In terms of outreach, however, *cultural humility* may be more appropriate. Cultural humility as conceptualized by Hook, Davis, Owen, Worthington and Utsey (2013) is the “ability to maintain an interpersonal stance that is other-oriented (or open to the other) in relation to aspects of cultural identity that are most important to the [person]” (p. 2). Practicing cultural humility does not allow one's prior expertise lead to overconfidence. Rather, it requires self-reflection and self-critique, the desire to redress power imbalances and development of mutually beneficial and non-paternalistic partnerships (Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998) at both the personal and institutional level. Outreach to address *acceptability* should incorporate *cultural humility*.⁴

2. Identify solutions and actions

It is wise to capitalize on time spent with community members. When conducting outreach to identify barriers, include an active effort to draw out potential solutions, ideas and actions to solve them.

Structure the outreach by presenting transportation modes in terms of the mechanics of using them. To do so, for example, identify documents (driver's license, credit card,) devices (cell phone, computers,) methods of payment (credit card, money order, cash,) access points, language capabilities, outreach materials, etc. Walk people through the process of signing up or using and then ask questions about what works, what doesn't. Leave time for unstructured and free flowing conversations to elicit nuanced questions and ideas. Engage and allow community members to drive the conversation. Take good notes. The information gathered should inform next steps.

4 The Works Cited page of this paper contains two academic references on this topic.

Some solutions to addressing barriers will be simple and inexpensive others may require significant investments. Shared mode providers (e.g. carshare, bikesare,) as small non-profit enterprises, may require public investment. Identifying criteria for where public funding should be invested to overcome barriers must be established. Other collaborative efforts to fund barrier elimination should also be identified as part of the aforementioned criteria. Transportation Demand Management (TDM) pool dollars, for example, could be a source of funding as suggested⁵ in Appendix E for addressing barriers associated with Way to Go's vanpool.

To address the impact on *access* improvements, a simple questionnaire standardized across outreach team members could be utilized. The simple survey, shown in Appendix A, is adapted from the research conducted by Penchansky and Thomas.⁶

Access for all will require collaboration, action and intent among governmental agencies, transportation providers, organizations with established community relationships and, most importantly, direct contact with Latino communities. Recognition of transportation as a basic need should be common ground for all involved. It is an essential understanding that all partners must have in working together to eliminate barriers to accessing affordable transportation.

3. Create relevant marketing materials and communication channels

The creation of marketing material and communication channels that are relevant straddles the access dimensions of *accommodation* (the manner in which the system is organized) and *acceptability* (the attitude of the system with respect to the client and the attitudes of the client with respect to the system.) *Accommodation* and *acceptability* strategies for education and information around transportation options should also consider preferences and abilities of the particular target audience. As an example, *accommodation* and *acceptability* tactics for Latino elders would likely differ greatly from those aimed at Latino youth.

Determine the appropriate form and placement of information. Form should accommodate those who need the information, whether in the right language, right size of font or the right medium (e.g. Spanish language radio ads or pictures to address illiteracy.) Placement should make the information ubiquitous and easy to find – ethnic grocery stores, Facebook ads,

5 This collaboration was suggested by Kenneth Boden of Way to Go in a meeting with him on September 1, 2016.

6 From their 1988 paper titled *The concept of access: definition and relationship to consumer satisfaction*.

online music services, etc. Use formats, images, colors and language that recalls something familiar. Respectfully celebrate cultural differences. Avoid stereotypes. Communication efforts, above all, must convey an authentic willingness to share the information.

Adapt a marketing style that is personal. Instead of sending off mass emails, run a booth at a community fair. Instead of press releases, visit a community meeting *and* stay until the end to answer questions and cultivate relationships. While posting flyers in key places can be effective, making phone calls to key people to help spread the message through word of mouth can be even more so. Use ethnic radio stations and have the message sponsored or direct-marketed by a grass roots organization that is trusted by the target audience.

4. Leverage community assets

The term *cultural broker* was coined by anthropologists who recognized that certain people could more easily go between two cultures than others. They recognized that these cultural brokers could link, bridge or mediate, naturally and seamlessly going back and forth between the values, beliefs, attitudes and practices of each of the two cultures. That ability brought insights and experiences to the table as well as the respect and trust of both communities.

Boulder County has many cultural brokers already working within organizations. They are employed at organizations such as Salud, OUR Center, The Association for Community Living (ACL,) Sister Carmen, Clinica, the Community Foundation's School Readiness Initiative and El Centro Amistad. There are also many within the county government organization at the Area Agency on Aging, Workforce, Community Action Programs and Casa de la Esperanza. Asset mapping that was part of this project identified some existing cultural brokers within the county government organization as well as within community partners. They are listed in Appendix C with detailed information in the Excel spreadsheet, M4A Latino Outreach Asset Map_mary.

In order to effectively leverage cultural brokers for the purpose of providing *access* to transportation options, it is necessary to first provide them with knowledge and proficiency around the options. Every outreach professional, internal and external to county government,

should recognize transportation as a basic need and be proficient in their familiarity regarding available affordable transportation options. Appendix D contains many ideas and suggestions to accomplish this.

Conclusion

This outreach strategy recognizes and acknowledges that the concept of *access* is complex and that its characteristic multi-dimensional nature requires a more comprehensive approach to conducting outreach to the Latino community (as well as any other ethnic or cultural group outside of the dominant culture.) As a consequence, the outreach itself should be handled with the deliberate intent of first identifying critical barriers. By thoughtfully and collaboratively addressing these barriers, the county can better facilitate opportunities for multi-cultural communities to *access* existing transportation options.

Outreach efforts should instill a cultural humility that recognizes:

- communities determine their own needs.
- community members are full partners in decision-making.
- communities should economically benefit from collaboration.
- communities should benefit from the transfer of knowledge and skills.

All too often efforts to embed knowledge within an organization do not extend beyond a single front-line person. Embedding knowledge about transportation access within organizational cultures will take time. The end game is that training and knowledge on affordable transportation options *transcend personnel changes*.

Success will require a commitment to long-term collaborative partnerships and time to realize the necessary organizational cultural shifts. Success will gather or redirect existing resources through self analysis that recognizes the five dimensions of access. Success will also recognize the dynamic linkage among housing, employment, family and, of course, transportation. The payoff is an equitable set of transportation options accessible to each and every member of our Boulder County community.

Works Cited

- Asbill, Lisa, Waters, Amanda. "Reflections on Cultural Humility." *American Psychological Association*, August 2013, <http://www.apa.org/pi/families/resources/newsletter/2013/08/cultural-humility.aspx>.
- Boulder County. (2016). Boulder County mobility for all needs assessment & action plan. San Francisco, CA: Nelson\Nygaard Consulting Associates, Inc.
- "Ciclistas Rascuaches vs ciclistas Catrines." *Radio Bilingüe*. National Latino Public Radio Network, KSJV, Fresno, 23 Aug. 2016.
- Community Toolbox*. Chapter 23. Modifying Access, Barriers, and Opportunities, Work Group for Community Health and Development at the University of Kansas, 2016, ctb.ku.edu/en/table-of-contents/implement/access-barriers-opportunities/overview/main.
- Diehl, David C., Guion, Lisa A. (n.d.) *Personal Marketing: A Strategy for Marketing Programs to Diverse Audiences*. Gainesville, FL: Florida Cooperative Extension, University of Florida.
- Guion, Lisa A., Kent, Heather. *Multicultural Communication*. Ethnic Marketing: A Strategy for Marketing Programs to Diverse Audience, Allied Media Corporation, allied-media.com/marketingtodiverseaudience.html.
- Hannig, James. "Community disengagement: The greatest barrier to equitable bike share." *Bicycle Justice and Urban Transformation*, edited by Aaron Golub, Melody L. Hoffman, Adonia E. Lugo and Gerardo F. Sandoval, Routledge, 2016, pp. 203-216.
- Hook, J. N., Davis, D. E., Owen, J., Worthington Jr., E. L., & Utsey, S. O. (2013, May 6). Cultural Humility: Measuring Openness to Culturally Diverse Clients. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*. Advance online publication. doi: 10.1037/a0032595.
- Kodransky, Michael, Lewenstein, Gabriel. Institute for Transportation & Development Policy. *Connecting Low-Income People to Opportunity with Shared Mobility*. 2014.
- León, Ray. "The Central Valley Was Ride-Sharing Long Before Uber." *Zócalo Public Square*, 21 July 2014, zocalopublicsquare.org/2014/07/21/the-central-valley-was-ride-sharing-long-before-uber/ideas/nexus/.
- Multicultural Marketing. (n.d.). Retrieved November 17, 2016 from Wikipedia: en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Multicultural_marketing.
- National Center for Cultural Competence. (2004). *Bridging the Cultural Divide in Health Care Settings: The Essential Role of Cultural Broker Programs*. Washington, DC: Goode, T., Sockalingam, S., Snyder, L. L.
- Nelson, Gary. "Ethnic marketing: When good intentions go wrong." *iMedia Connection*, 3 Nov. 2007, imediainconnection.com/articles/ported-articles/red-dot-articles/2007/nov/ethnic-

Works Cited

[marketing-when-good-intentions-go-wrong/](#).

Penchansky, R., Thomas, J. W. (1988) The concept of access: definition and relationship to consumer satisfaction. *Medical Care*, 19 (2), 127-140.

Stiffler, Chris, Vasan, Thamanna. Colorado Fiscal Institute. *Ticket to Thrive: A Solution for Affordable Transit in the Denver Region*. 2016.

Tervalon, M., & Murray-Garcia, J. (1998). Cultural humility versus cultural competence: A critical distinction in defining physician training outcomes in multicultural education. *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved*, 9, 117-125.

Wright, Macala. "4 new rules for multicultural marketing." *Mashable*, 24 July 2015, [mashable.com/2015/07/24/multicultural-marketing-tactics/#V5f2IMIV2Gq3](#).

APPENDIX A – Satisfaction Survey Sample

AVAILABILITY	1. All things considered, how much confidence do you have in you and your family being able to get to where you need to go when you need to go?
	2. How satisfied are you with your ability to find transportation for the whole family?
	3. How satisfied are you with your knowledge of where to go for transportation information?
	4. How satisfied are you with you ability to find transportation in an emergency?
ACCESSIBILITY	5. How satisfied are you with how convenient transportation is to your home?
	6. How difficult is it to get transportation?
ACCOMMODATION	7. How satisfied are you with how long you have to wait for transportation?
	8. How satisfied are you with how convenient transportation is for you?
AFFORDABILITY	9. How satisfied are you with the price of transporatation?
	10. How satisfied are you with how you pay for transportation?
ACCEPTABILITY	11. How satisfied are you with the appearance of transportation?
	12. How satisfied are you with the appearance of others you see on transportation?

Survey from Penchansky and Thomas Research

TABLE 1. Patient Satisfaction Questions

Access Dimension	Questions
AVAILABILITY	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All things considered, how much confidence do you have in being able to get good medical care for you and your family when you need it? 2. How satisfied are you with your ability to find one good doctor to treat the whole family? 3. How satisfied are you with your knowledge of where to get health care? 4. How satisfied are you with your ability to get medical care in an emergency?
ACCESSIBILITY	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. How satisfied are you with how convenient your physician's offices are to your home? 6. How difficult is it for you to get to your physician's office?
ACCOMMODATION	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. How satisfied are you with how long you have to wait to get an appointment? 8. How satisfied are you with how convenient physicians' office hours are? 9. How satisfied are you with how long you have to wait in the waiting room? 10. How satisfied are you with how easy it is to get in touch with your physician(s)?
AFFORDABILITY	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 11. How satisfied are you with your health insurance? 12. How satisfied are you with the doctors' prices? 13. How satisfied are you with how soon you need to pay the bill?
ACCEPTABILITY	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 14. How satisfied are you with the appearance of the doctor's offices? 15. How satisfied are you with the neighborhoods their offices are in? 16. How satisfied are you with the other patients you usually see at the doctors' offices?

APPENDIX B – Translation Tool

ENGLISH	SPANISH TERMS	PREFERENCE
Car	Automóvil, Carro, Coche, Vehículo	Carro
Bus	Autobús, Camión, Bus	Autobús
Fuel	Combustible, Gasolina	Gasolina
Bicycle	Bicicleta, Bici	Bicicleta
Van	Camioneta, Furgoneta, Minibús, Monovolumen	Camioneta
Older Adult	Persona de tercera edad, Persona grande, Viejo	Adulto mayor
Bike rack	Armazón, Caballete, Rejilla, Portabicicleta	Portabicicleta
Bus shelter	Refugio, Caseta, Marquesina, Parada de bus con techo	Caseta
Bike shelter	Almacén, Resguardo, Caseta para bicicletas	Caseta para bicicletas
Grocery shopping	Mandado, Mercado, Tienda	Mercado
Job	Trabajo, Empleo, Tarea	Trabajo
Money order	Giro bancario, Giro	Giro
Checking account	Cuenta de cheques, cuenta bancaria	Cuenta de cheques
Debit card	Tarjeta de débito, tarjeta de cobro automático	Tarjeta de débito
Cell phone	Celular, Teléfono móvil	Celular
Affordable	Asequible, Barato, Económico	Barato, económico
Unaffordable	Caro, Prohibitivo	Caro
Doctor	Doctor, Médico	Doctor

Appendix C – Media Dropoff & Cultural Brokers

This is not a comprehensive list.

MEDIA DROPOFF	
LOCATIONS/NAME/DEPARTMENT	TYPE
Fruteria – Broadway Street, North Boulder	Physical site
Fruteria - 30 th and Valmont, Boulder	Physical site
Compañeras Facebook page	Social Media
Mitú (sample video)	Social Media
El Comité	Physical site
Elks Lodge	Physical site

CULTURAL BROKERS		
ORGANIZATION/DEPT	GROUP NAME	CONTACT
Sister Carmen	Latina Group	Robin Lincoln
Salud	Care Management	Monica Rodriguez
Our Center	Program Director	Veronica Orona
Association for Community Living (ACL)	Caminando Juntos (family group)	Eugenia Brady
Clinica	Case Management	Miriam Garcia
Community Foundation of Boulder County	School Readiness Initiative	There are three promotoras: Lafayette, Longmont, Boulder
Workforce	Education & Training	Alejandra Saba
Workforce	Case Management	Elsa Dominguez
Boulder County	Area Agency on Aging	Guio Bravo
Boulder County	Community Services	Eliberto Mendoza
Boulder County	Public Health	Maya Sol Dansie
Boulder County	Housing & Human Services	Mireya Sosa
El Centro Amistad	Promotora Program	Ana Karina Casas Ibarra

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

The list below reflects a set of ideas identified throughout the process of developing this outreach strategy. Some are tactical ways in which to conduct outreach and communication, others are simple program ideas. While some transportation needs of the Latino community were identified through the Mobility for All Needs Assessment, this process identified others.

1: Five Modes, Five Destinations

No: 1		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Five modes, five destinations presented in a culturally relevant manner.		Use the Mexican lotería game (similar to bingo in the United States) as a way to message available transportation options in a culturally relevant manner and design the materials so that they will work for everyone. To communicate specifics, use <i>fotonovela</i> techniques.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Effective and inclusive communication about options regardless of literacy level, language or ethnicity.		Develop a poster to communicate how each mode is used. Develop an individual card for each mode. Image on one side, fotonovela style instructions and information on back.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Short	\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Through the course of the writing of this strategy, marketing and communication materials have been designed incorporating the ideas presented in this paper using Loteria graphics and the fotonovela. Loteria is a popular game originating from Mexico, but recognized as well throughout most of Latin America. The original images are very recognizable to many Latinos. Although fotonovelas commonly refer to soap opera like television series, the term also refers to print graphic novels. The technique has been widely used to communicate a variety of programs and information.

The Modes: Boulder County is rich in transportation options. This marketing and communication approach focused on the shared modes of bikeshare, carshare, vanpool, transit and walking.

The Destinations: People’s lives are complex and filled with a myriad of locations they must visit to meet their every day needs. However, at the most basic level, people want health, safety, education, economic security and the best for their children. In light of this, we chose to focus on church, groceries, doctors, school and work.

Use the Mexican lotería game (similar to bingo in the United States) as a way to message available transportation options in a culturally relevant manner and design the materials so that

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

they will work for everyone. To communicate specifics, use *fotonovela* techniques.

Pilot with five destinations and five modes each illustrated by an image echoing the lotería deck, using the colors of the program represented. Use a poster matrix of modes and destinations to illustrate which modes work best for each destination. Display this poster at locations such as ethnic grocery stores, beauty salons, clothing stores, churches as well as a variety of county offices.

The brightly colored cards are intended to stand-alone. The back of the card provides “how to” information using graphic novel style images and minimal text through “thought bubbles.” All information is presented in Spanish and English.

Brand in such way that across all departments, providers and partners there is a common language and recognizable device to use for communicating transportation options. Embed the device(s) at key access departments.

2: Embedded Community Experts

No: 2		Category: Organizational, Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Embedded community experts		Given limited funding, one of the best ways to maintain ongoing knowledge about transportation programs and options within the Latino community is to embed the expertise (sometimes referred to as cultural brokers or promotores) within the Latino community.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Over time, if the programs meet people's needs, the information will be passed down through personal and social networks.		Identify organizations with appropriate personnel, capacity and willingness to commit to hands on training on options. Start with MOC members to establish.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Via	Medium	\$\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

3: Standardized Modular Presentation

No: 3		Category: Organization, Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Standardized modular presentation		"Transportation 101" presentation that varies according to client/destination/department/partner needs that is embedded organizationally such that broad familiarity of the options among employees and community partners is cultivated.	
Benefits		Action Items	

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Field experience would cultivate empathy on the difficulty in reaching certain destinations which could spawn ideas to improve service delivery.		Develop ongoing field focused transportation seminars for staff and partners to provide them with direct experience with options, making them more likely to promote them to community members (clients) and perhaps even use them themselves.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Medium - Long	\$\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

4: Brochure Stickers

No: 4	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area	Description		
Brochure stickers	Create individual stickers of bus route names and/or numbers for easy application on brochures, flyers, etc.		
Benefits	Action Items		
To educate employees at destinations about nearby bus routes and convey the same information to clients.	Stickers developed. Distribute to organizations.		
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Source
M4All	Short	\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Low

5: Keeping Metrics on Impact

No: 5	Category: Organizational		
Strategy Area	Description		
Keeping metrics on impact.	All intakes for all organizations (internal and external) ask the same two transportation related questions of clients. Questions could be a subset of those in Satisfaction Survey in Appendix A.		
Benefits	Action Items		
Track impact of outreach efforts.	Research to look for metrics already being kept that could be used for this purpose.		
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Long	\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Low	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

6: Co-brand Affordable Transportation Options

No: 6		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Co-brand of affordable transportation options		Partner with B-cycle, eGo, Way to Go, RTD on use of Loteria images.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Collaboration among affordable transportation to increase cultural competency		Meet with potential partners to determine interest.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Long	\$\$	DRCOG
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

7: Transit Access Advocacy Sub-Committee

No: 7		Category: Access to transit	
Strategy Area		Description	
Transit Access Advocacy sub-committee		Through the Local Coordinating Council (LCC), create a sub-committee that advocates on behalf of under-served clients. Policy issues could range from organizational “little p” to state level “big P.”	
Benefits		Action Items	
Breakdown of policy barriers.		Determine interest within LCC, identify committee members, develop the mission.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Via	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

8: Field Trip Workshops

No: 8		Category: Organizational	
Strategy Area		Description	
Field trip workshops		Create opportunities for HHS and partners (e.g. Center for People with Disabilities, Association for Community Living, El Comité, Inn Between) staff to obtain first hand experience in using multi-modal options. Field trips: Safeway, King Soopers to get discount tickets/passes, use an eGo car, use B-cycle, use of regional, local buses, lightrail and RTD online tools.	

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Benefits		Action Items	
Provide experiential knowledge of transportation option so staff can make well informed recommendations.		Develop and schedule workshops, make them mandatory elements of staff job descriptions.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Medium	\$	M4All general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

9: Car Ownership Class

No: 9	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area	Description		
Car ownership class	Develop courses on the cost of car ownership, maintenance and predatory sales and lending.		
Benefits	Action Items		
Raise awareness about true costs of car ownership and related financial dangers.	Develop course.		
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Longmont Public Library	Medium	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

10: Direct Outreach to Women

No: 10	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area	Description		
Direct outreach to women.	Conduct multi-modal transportation outreach targeted at women.		
Benefits	Action Items		
Increased access to options for Latinas would also extend into entire family.	Start at annual Cumbre de Mujeres event, partner with eGo and B-Cycle to present workshop, bring cars and bikes to events, sign people up.		
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
eGo and B-cycle	Medium	\$\$	Transportation general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

11: Strategy Recruit Latino Drivers

No: 11		Category: Organizational	
Strategy Area		Description	
Recruit Latino drivers.		A collaborative effort among Boulder County Care Connect, Via, Faith in Action, Longmont Senior Center, El Centro Amistad and El Comité (volunteer driver programs and Latino serving organizations) to develop strategy for engaging Latino paid and volunteer drivers.	
Benefits		Action Items	
By increasing number of Latino drivers, number of Latino clients would increase.		Determine level of interest, develop outreach plan, determine eligibility requirements for drivers, develop training, assist with obtaining required documents (Driver's Licenses, CDLs.)	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Long	\$\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

12: Multi-modal Rewards Program

No: 12		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Multi-modal rewards program		Partner with Latino serving businesses (carnicerias, clothing stores, beauty salons, WalMart, Walgreens) to create a rewards program (e.g. 10 punches gets you two hours of free carshare, B-Cycle pass, or bus pass.) Display of Loteria poster could signal participating location.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Nothing says use me like an earned pass in your hand!		Meet with Latino Chamber to determine interest.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Latino Chamber of Commerce	Long	\$\$	In City of Boulder, could potentially fund with 2H money by tying reward to purchase of healthy food.
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

13: On-site Minute Hand Schedule

No: 13		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
On-site minute hand bus schedule.		Post bus schedules graphically at bus stops, e.g. use a clock with only the minute hand to convey arrival time.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Communicates schedule without paper or internet in a low literacy manner.		Research viability.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Multi-modal staff	Medium	\$	Transportation general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

14: No Wrong Door for Transportation

No: 14		Category: Organizational	
Strategy Area		Description	
No wrong door for transportation		Portals for signing people up for various options at HHS and partner locations.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Improve access.		Research feasibility and cost.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Medium	\$	General fund
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

15: Vanpool Outreach at Construction Sites

No: 15		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Way to Go vanpool outreach		Partner with Way to Go to identify and work with construction workers/companies to promote DRCOG vanpool use. Target workers who are already carpooling.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Equitable access to vanpool by Latino workers.		Research level of interest of construction companies and barriers to use.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Way to Go	Long	\$	DRCOG
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

16: Earn-a-car Program

No: 16	Category: Affordability		
Strategy Area		Description	
Earn-a-car		Earn-a-car Program similar to Earn-a-bike. Donated vehicles coupled with Arapahoe Ridge car maintenance program.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Lower barriers to car ownership. Could be used as incentive to become a volunteer driver.		Meet with Arapahoe Ridge car maintenance program to determine level of interest.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Arapahoe Ridge High School	Long	\$\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

17: Low Cost Car Repair Network

No: 17	Category: Affordability		
Strategy Area		Description	
Low cost car repair network		Develop a network of car mechanics (maybe partner with Via garage) that would offer low or no cost car repair in exchange for volunteer driving.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Lower cost barrier to car repair.		Determine level of interest. Flesh out process.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Long	\$	Transportation general
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)		Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	

18: Catalyze a Spanish Driving Class

No: 18	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Catalyze a Spanish language driving class.		Catalyze creation of a Spanish language driving class within Boulder County. The closest driving class available in Spanish is in Brighton. Kind of tough to get there if you don't know how to drive!	
Benefits		Action Items	
Reduce barriers to learning to drive. Class would provide students with safe driving skills.		Find interested partner.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
A local driving school	Medium	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

19: Enforce against illegal resale of Driver's License Appointments

No: 19	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Enforce against illegal resale of non-citizen driver's license appointments.		Non-citizen drivers' license appointments are being sold for up to \$120. Enforce recent legislation that makes this practice illegal.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Reduce predatory practice.		Work with District Attorney's office.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
District Attorney	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

20: Employer Distributed Discount Passes

No: 20	Category: Affordability, Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Employer distributed discount passes, coupon books.		Partner with employers to make available discount passes and coupon books on-site as part of M4All pilot project to resell to non-profits.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Reduce access barriers to passes.		Determine feasibility of business as resale location.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Medium	\$	

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium
---	--------	--	--------

21: Set-up Weekly/Monthly Remote Office Hours

No: 21	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Set-up weekly or monthly remote office hours for Via mobility specialist.		Set-up a regular remote office hours at organizations such as Our Center, EFAA and Sister Carmen.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Direct reach of clients.		Meet with Via.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Via	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

22: Lotería for Boulder CAGID

No: 22	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Lotería branding in partnership with CAGID (Central Area General Improvement District) and DBI (Downtown Business Inc.)		Partner with DBI to raise CAGID EcoPass awareness through uniform branding to reach Latino workers.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Equitable pass distribution.		Meet with DBI to determine need.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
DBI	Medium	\$	CAGID
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

23: Leverage the MOC

No: 23	Category: Organizational		
Strategy Area		Description	
Leverage the MOC		Ensure that all outreach and employees with direct contact to Latino population are part of MOC. Use MOC as an opportunity to embed transportation options knowledge among Boulder County outreach staff.	
Benefits		Action Items	

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

Increases view of transportation as a basic need and embeds options knowledge more broadly.		Make part of MOC mission.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Boulder County MOC	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Low

24: Latino Community Sounding Board

No: 24	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Establish a Latino Community Sounding Board		Cultivate a Latino community sounding board – to serve as source of feedback, ideas and solutions on everything county (not just transportation). Make it official, i.e. nominations, appointment by commissioners, recognition certificates, etc. Appoint community members.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Engage Latino community members in government and development of programs with them.		Float idea by Commissioners.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Boulder County	Medium	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

25: Spanish Information Repositories

No: 25	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Spanish information repositories		Develop a list of locations (include businesses: mercados, beauty salons, etc.) for keeping Spanish language outreach material up-to-date and develop relationships with location proprietors.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Access to material where people are at.		Check existing LCC list for locations already on list, develop list through outreach, meetings and outings.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Medium	\$	
Benefit to Community	Medium	Level of Effort	Medium

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

(High, Medium, Low)		(High, Medium, Low)	
---------------------	--	---------------------	--

26: Music, Fun, Bikes

No: 26	Category: Information and Marketing		
Strategy Area		Description	
Make multi-modal travel learning fun!		Organize “bicicumbias,” “bicrodeos” and “bicicocinas”– bike events with community as forum to teach riding skills, point out infrastructure improvements, safe streets, safe routes, bike workshops, etc.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Cultivating community and community engagement.		Start with Colorado Latino Festival in June.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Chain Reaction	Medium	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	High

27: Transportation as Line Item

No: 27	Category: Organizational		
Strategy Area		Description	
Transportation as line item on grant proposals.		Work with funding organizations such as the Boulder County Community Foundation, Front Range United Way to include a budget line items for transportation. Transportation is often an afterthought in project funding.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Raise awareness of transportation as a basic need and insure grant funded projects include transportation funding.		Determine if this requires changing a common grant form and if so, what the process is.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
Community Foundation of Boulder County	Long	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Appendix D – Ideas for Programs and Tactics

28: Multi-cultural Transportation Outreach Collaborative

No: 28		Category: Organizational	
Strategy Area		Description	
Multi-cultural transportation outreach collaborative		Form a multi-cultural transportation outreach collaborative through a sub-committee of the Local Coordinating Council and later extend to include outreach professionals from non-profit organizations.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Leverage existing cultural brokers within organizations already regularly convening around topic of transportation.		Discuss at LCC, determine interest, form sub-committee.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	Medium	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

29: Transportation Information Boards at Clinics

No:		Category: Information and Marketing	
Strategy Area		Description	
Transportation information boards are available at clinics.		Catalyze the creation of a single location at clinics for posting information about transit and other options.	
Benefits		Action Items	
Community knows where to look for information.		Check to see if boards already exist.	
Possible Lead Agency	Implementation Time Frame	Planning Level Cost	Potential Funding Sources
M4All	Short	\$	
Benefit to Community (High, Medium, Low)	High	Level of Effort (High, Medium, Low)	Medium

Appendix E - Modes/Barriers/Solutions

Carshare

Ego CarShare has worked with Boulder County on a pilot to make carsharing available to Longmont Housing Authority and Boulder County Housing Authority residents. Along the way, barriers have been identified and creative solutions arrived at.

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Information in Spanish (accommodation)	A “what is carshare” video available in Spanish on website.
Driver's license required (accommodation, acceptability)	Accept foreign driver's licenses accompanied by official two year driving history or appropriate date of issue on license.
Credit card required for payment (accommodation, acceptability)	Can pre-pay with check, cash or money order. No minimum.
Bilingual reservations (accommodation)	One employee is bilingual, but not available 24/7. Monolingual members can also use 24/7 mobile app

Bikeshare

A pilot program in partnership with eGo and Denver Housing Authority allowed B-Cycle to identify some barriers and develop some solutions. These barriers are taken from Hannig (2016). Community driven identification of barriers and solutions is needed in this area.

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Credit card required to join and use (accommodation, acceptability)	For subsidized groups, one debit card can be dedicated to several users.
Program not designed for demographic (acceptability)	Have developed a method for signing up people on-site, hand out user cards immediately and teach new members how to use the system
Stations not available in Latino neighborhoods (accessibility)	Pilot a small station in a strategic neighborhood in parallel with outreach to identify other barriers to use.
Internet access required to join (availability, accommodation, acceptability)	Market bikeshare at popular data hotspots. Many Latinos have smart phones but may lack data access.
Status and Image incompatible with culture (acceptability)	Engage the community: sponsor group rides of women, youth, families
Bilingual (accommodation)	Has a Spanish speaker on staff and Spanish “what is” video, though not posted on website.
Family Barriers:	
Users must be older than 16 (accommodation, acceptability)	Research reason for age minimum.

MODES/BARRIERS/SOLUTIONS

30 minute free period (accommodation, acceptability)	Appropriate length of “free” period may be determined by outreach. Set customized minimums by request.
---	--

Vanpool

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Weekend and non-employment use not allowed due to federal funding constraints (availability, accommodation)	Develop a pilot proposal for other uses as part of upcoming 2017 TDM pool funding (CMAQ) cycle. Way to Go willing to partner.
Outreach does not reach Latinos (accommodation, acceptability)	Conduct outreach at employment centers such as construction sites.

Public Transit

The legislation that governs RTD, declares that, “Public transportation services are provided to assist the transit-dependent and the poor, to relieve congestion and to minimize automotive pollution.” *And, not* or. Transit is highly utilized low-income Latino communities.

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Fares structure (affordability, accommodation, acceptability)	The 50/150 program recommended by the Colorado Fiscal Institute in its report, <i>Ticket to Thrive</i> .
Insufficient weekend and evening service (availability)	Work with RTD
Full grocery carts cannot be collapsed (acceptability)	Work with RTD
Schedules and routes designed for commuters (acceptability)	Work with RTD
Exclusion of desired destinations such as child and medical care (accommodation, acceptability)	Work with RTD
Access-a-ride	
Reservations cannot be made in Spanish (accommodation)	This is a Title VI violation. RTD claims that Spanish is available, but various clients can testify that it is not.
Qualification requires travel to Easter Seals in Lakewood	Mobile qualification at different municipalities once or twice per year.

Appendix E - Modes/Barriers/Solutions

Walking

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Complete streets	Invest in sidewalk infrastructure and work with municipalities to identify pedestrian routes.
Safety	Install streetlights to create opportunities to be outside safely after dark

Paratransit

BARRIER	SOLUTION
Unavailable for urgent medical care (availability)	Work with Via
Linguistic Competence (acceptability)	Work with Via on program to hire drivers who can communicate with non-English speakers.